Suggestions for a Design Critique (adapted from work by Maggie Hendrie, Chair, Interaction Design Department)

Suggestions for a Design Critique Maggie Hendrie, Chair, Interaction Design Department	● ArtCenter College of Design

Our goal is to create a safe framework to practice presenting, giving and receiving critique. Skilled critique is about iteration and improvement. A good collaborative critique provides focused, actionable insights that support the designer's goal and process; ad hoc feedback and opinion aren't critique. Also avoid in-depth problem solving and trying to make design decisions. Schedule follow-up conversations or work sessions to drill into these types of details.

Presenting Your Work	Receiving Critique	Giving Critique
Arrive early, put up and prepare work before the instructor arrives so that you can start on time. Present rough designs with as much attention as you would a finished piece of work. Outline the format at beginning of meeting (for example - that you will present for X minutes, then take questions and comments). Present with a beginning, middle and summary ending. Put your work in context. Every time you show your work, even if it is to the same audience every week, state: • What we are looking at • The key project goals. Give short brief including problem, key users, main scenarios and design principles that were followed • Where you are in the process: research, analysis, ideation, prototyping • What you are trying to resolve, create or develop • Summarize constraints, requirements and design strategy Give short narrative on your objectives, making sure to describe desired qualities, intention, expectations, and definition of success. State any specific feedback you would like.	• Take notes and say thank you. • Ask clarifying questions about the respondents' point of view. Do not be defensive about your work but be prepared to discuss the choices and decisions you made in relation to the project brief and criteria • You do not have to commit to any action based on the feedback but should acknowledge that you heard the speaker • Develop and analyze a high level proposed solution with everyone else if it doesn't take you off track • Ask quiet people for feedback directly • Paraphrase feedback for comprehension and establish links between similar comments • If you don't understand, ask for clarification, and when appropriate, ask for examples • Recap the main points you heard and consider any emerging themes and/or patterns • Share your next steps and timeline	• Gather your notes, record initial observations, and give feedback in the context of the project brief and criteria/expectations for the work • Make sure your comments are appropriate for the stage of the work • What was the designer trying to solve or discover? How effective is their work in achieving this? • Evaluate how well the proposed solution or insight supports the stated project goals. Give specific examples of why or why not? • Give examples, sources and references where possible • Don't assume - ask questions to clarify intent, constraints and design thinking • Are there issues that the designer should have resolved but didn't – why? • Are there new problems that arise as a result of the current version and approach? • Include strengths. Be sure to say what works (in relation to the criteria, class content, and from your own understanding and experience)